Empirical Analysis of Faculty-to-Faculty Incivility

Implementing Best Practices to Foster Civility and Healthy Academic Work Environments

Nursing Education Research Conference 2018
Cynthia Clark PhD, RN, ANEF, FAAN
Welcome and Gratitude!

National League for Nursing

Sigma

Global Nursing Excellence

Thank You
OBJECTIVES

- Describe a brief overview of civility and incivility in nursing education
- Review findings from empirical studies on faculty-to-faculty incivility
- Discuss best practices to foster civility and healthy work environments
- Celebrate success!
A crucial measure of our success in life is the way we treat one another every day of our lives.

— P.M. Forni
Defining Key Concepts
Authentic *respect* for others requiring time, presence, engagement, and an intention to seek common ground.

Clark & Carnosso (2008)
Workplace Aggression

Incivility, Bullying, and Mobbing
Workplace Incivility

A range of lower intensity acts of aggression (including failing to take action when action is warranted) which may result in psychological or physiological distress for the people involved. And, if left unaddressed, may spiral into more purposeful efforts to harm another and/or into more threatening situations.

It’s not only what we do… *but what we don’t do*

Staying silent when speaking up is indicated, failing to acknowledge or support a co-worker, ignoring others, withholding important or vital information.
Workplace Bullying

Repeated, persistent, targeted pattern of abusive behavior designed to intimidate, degrade, and humiliate another. Usually characterized by a person asserting power over another.
Workplace Mobbing

Rankism
Abuse of power or position to demean, diminish, or disadvantage another

Fuller, 2003; 2006
Joy Stealing

Faculty-Faculty Incivility/Civility Study
PURPOSE

Using A Mixed Methods Design

Examine faculty perceptions of faculty-to-faculty incivility in nursing education and explore ways to address the problem

Clark, 2013; Clark, Olender, Kenski, & Cardoni, 2013
Instrument

Faculty-to-Faculty Incivility Survey: Quantitative Items

Psychometric Testing for Validity and Reliability
- Expert Panel Review
- Extensive Pilot Testing
- Cronbach’s Alpha (0.965)
- Exploratory Factor Analysis (3 factors)
- Preliminary Item Response Analysis
- Inter-item Coefficients

Revised: Workplace Incivility/Civility Survey (WICS)—30 studies in academic and practice settings in USA and Canada (Intervention and Replication Studies)
Research Questions

- Extent of the problem
- Contributing factors to faculty-to-faculty incivility
- If and why faculty avoid addressing incivility
- Effective ways to foster civility and healthy work environments
Respondents

588 Nursing Faculty from 40 States

- Female (97%) Male (3%)
- Caucasian (88%) African American (6%) Other (6%)
- Age Range: 27 to 78 years (most 40 years or older)
- Median time spent teaching=10 years (Range 1-40 years)
- Mix of assistant, associate, and full professors (71%)
  - Remainder: Clinical or non-tenure-track
- Taught in pre-licensure programs (62%) Master’s or doctoral level (55%)
Results and Findings
67.4% Moderate to Serious Problem
8 Themes Identified
Qualitative Content Analysis (Narrative)

Berating, Insulting, and Allowing [Verbal and Non-Verbal]

- Rude, insulting, demeaning remarks and gestures…frequently in front of others
- Often occurred in faculty and committee meetings where the behavior was tolerated, ignored, and allowed to occur
- Screaming, fist pounding, door slamming, throwing items, putting fist through wall
Setting-up, Undermining, and Sabotaging

- Intentionally undermining, sabotaging, setting others up to fail
- Using improper channels or questionable methods [e.g. blind copied e-mails] to subvert, misrepresent, or undermine others
Power Playing, Abusing, Colluding

- Power plays, abusing position or authority, ganging up, joining forces
- Treating junior, adjunct, new, clinical or faculty without the ‘right’ degree with disdain and disrespect
Excluding, Gossiping, Degrading

- Ignoring, marginalizing, shunning, avoiding, and excluding
- Conducting secretive and clandestine meetings
- Gossiping, spreading rumors, degrading others
Refusing, Not doing, Justifying [Favoritism]

- Refusing to do one's share of the workload or being assigned an easier or inequitable workload
- Justify "not doing" … by having more urgent, pressing, or important work to do
Blaming and Accusing

- Faculty blamed and falsely accused of something they did not do; often with no evidence of wrong-doing.

- Accusations often ill-founded, but taken as truth. The accused felt powerless to ‘prove’ their innocence.
Taking Credit (Ripping Off) Others Work

- Subtle and blatant attempts [and successes] at taking intellectual property or course content for their own gain or without obtaining permission or giving credit.
Distracting and Disrupting Meetings

- Using computers, mobile devices, and engaging in other non-meeting related activities [grading papers, side conversations]
Top Factors Contributing to Faculty-to-Faculty Incivility

- Stress
- Demanding or inequitable workloads
- Unclear roles and expectations
- Imbalance or abuse of power and authority
- Organizational volatility and instability
- Ineffective leadership
Reasons for Avoiding Addressing Incivility

78.5% of respondents avoid addressing incivility

- Fear of retaliation
- Lack of administrator support
- No clear policies to address incivility
- It takes too much time and effort
- May lead to poor evaluations
- Lack skills (or confidence) to address incivility
- Makes matters worse
- Feel powerless (new, non-tenured, adjunct, clinical faculty)
Impact of Workplace Incivility

- Low morale, low productivity, high turn-over, and early retirement
- Increased absenteeism, tardiness, ‘presenteeism’ *(leaving without leaving)*
- Diminished quality of work *(especially of once highly productive people)*
- Lack of meaningful participation in governance activities
- Working at home more than usual
- Increased isolation—*flying under the radar*
- Increased illness and health issues

*(Clark et al, 2016; Clark, 2013; Twale & DeLuca, 2008; Cipriano, 2001; Davenport, Schwartz, & Elliott 1999)*
Strategies To Address Academic Incivility

- Use direct and transparent communication
- Employ trustworthy, skilled, principled leaders
- Measure and address incivility (Accountability)
- Implement policies and protocols to foster HWEs
- Invest in faculty development and skill building experiences
- Transform the organizational culture
- Build and foster faculty relationships and collaborations
Foster Civility and Healthy Work Environments
Evidenced-Based Strategies
Example is not the main thing in influencing others. It is the only thing.

Albert Schweitzer
Enhancing Emotional Intelligence, Self Awareness, Openness to Feedback
Transforming the Culture
Pathway for Fostering Organizational Civility

Hiking Path near Driggs, Idaho

Clark, 2013; 2017
Step 1—Raise Awareness and Build Organizational and Leadership Support
Step 2—Measure Workplace Health
Identify and Maximize Strengths
Step 3—Assemble and Empower a Civility (Organizational Culture) Team

Clark, 2013, 2017; Maxfield et al, 2011
Step 4—Develop an Evidence-Based Data-Driven Action Plan
Step 5—Implement an Evidence-Based Data-Driven Action Plan
Establish, Implement, and Commit to **Unambiguous** Foundational Statements
Vision/Mission Statement: Exemplar

To create and sustain a campus culture that models civility, inclusion, diversity, and affirms the value of all members of the campus community.
Shared Values: Exemplar

- Academic Excellence and Service
- Global Citizenship and Social Justice
- Inclusion and Diversity
- Integrity and Accountability
- Civility and Respect
- Collaboration and Connectedness
Pledge of Civility and Well-Being
[Commitment, Charter, Promise, Creed]

- Vision, mission, strategic goals, values
- Commitment to civility and well-being
- Well-defined norms/ground rules
- Accountability measures
Recognize that every opinion is valuable
Express and receive feedback without making it personal
Stop collusion, direct the issue back to the owner
Practice authentic listening
Encourage discussion of ideas and issues, not people
Celebrate each other’s successes
Treat others as you wish to be treated
Hire for Civility
Robust Vetting of Candidates

Maintain a High Bar – Don’t be Tempted to Settle
Policies, Procedures, and Guidelines
Confidential Reporting Systems
Addressing Incivility; Rewarding Civility
Linking Healthy Work Environment Criteria to Performance

360° Evaluation Based On:
Vision, Mission, Values, Charter/Pledge, Norms
Culture of Accountability

Circle of Support

Behavioral Event Review Team (BERT)

Restorative Justice: Public Apologies
Skill Building

- Effective Communication
- Constructive Conflict Management

Don’t make the mistake of assuming people can “just do it.” Effective organizations use training, education, 'script development' and role play to improve communication and constructive conflict negotiation skills.

Maxfield et al, 2011
Cognitive Rehearsal: Evidence-Based Strategy to address uncivil behavior: Consists of 5 parts:

1. Pre-briefing and preparatory learning
2. Identifying and describing uncivil scenarios for simulation
3. Using evidence-based frameworks to role-play and rehearse responses (creating a personalized statement)—Scripting!
4. Using deliberate practice to reinforce learning experience
5. De-briefing and reflection

Griffin 2004; Griffin & Clark, 2014; Sanner-Stiehr, 2017; Longo, 2017; Clark, in press
Success Stories
• Forward-Thinking and Visionary Dean with Committed Leadership Team
• Implemented PFOC
• Faculty & Staff (240) (WICS), Students (Narratives) Both (Focus Groups)
• Fully Engaged, Creative, Enthusiastic *Spirit of Well-Being Team*
• Data-Driven Action Plan: Interventions
  ▪ Honor Code with FON Norms
  ▪ Pop-Up Blog and Online Engagement Boards: “*Spirit of Wellbeing Moments*”
  ▪ Policy Development for Healthy Campus Work Environment (in progress)
  ▪ Civility Workshops: Skill-Building (Conflict Negotiation, Communication, Team-Building)
  ▪ Campus-Wide Wellness & Professional Well-Being Initiatives
  ▪ Celebrations—Short and long-term wins!
Progress: One Year Later

- Highly engaged, committed faculty and staff
- Collaborating with practice partners to co-create a vision for HWE
- Students participating in *Spirit of Well-Being* initiatives (Honor Code)
- Significant and positive shift toward a healthy work environment
- Preparing peer-reviewed publication on their experience
Motivated and Engaged President, Provost, Dean, and Director

- Highly problematic nursing department: Toxic culture with high levels of incivility
- Implemented PFOC
- Faculty, Staff (17) (WICS) Student Meetings
- Data-Driven Action Plan: Interventions
  - New Leadership within the School of Nursing
  - Co-Creation and Implementation of a Civility Charter with Norms
  - Implemented a Shared Governance Model
  - Skill-Building: Constructive Communication, Conflict Negotiation, Team-Building
  - Faculty-Facilitated Student Mentoring Program (Student Peer-Mentoring Program in progress)
  - Campus-Wide Wellness & Professional Well-Being Initiatives
  - Salary-equity committee formed (Provost-led, Campus-wide Initiative)
Significant improvement in WICS Scores including:
- Overall civility score increased from 47 to 72 (0-100)
- Moderate to serious level of incivility dropped from 100%-50%
- Confidence levels rose from 70-90% in addressing incivility
- Drop in frequency on all 23 workplace incivilities
- Qualitative findings improved dramatically
- Faculty express feeling ‘joy’ and a ‘sense of accomplishment’

Significant and positive shift toward a healthy work environment. An overall culture of incivility, mistrust, and disrespect has been replaced by a sense of teamwork, civility, collaboration, and collegiality.
I've learned that people will forget what you said, people will forget what you did, but people will never forget how you made them feel. 

Maya Angelou
Thank You

Cynthia Clark PhD, RN, ANEF, FAAN
Strategic Nursing Advisor | ATI Nursing Education
Professor Emeritus
Founder of Civility Matters©
cindy.clark@atitesting.com