



# ENGLISH AS A SECOND LANGUAGE NURSING STUDENTS' PERCEPTIONS OF STAFF NURSE INCIVILITY

Dissertation by: Judith G. Ruvalcaba, EdD, MSN, RN



## INTRODUCTION

- Background
- *Incivility in the clinical setting*
    - Importance of clinical experiences
    - The relationship between student nurses and staff nurses
    - What makes nursing students vulnerable
  - *English as Second Language Nursing Students (ESL)*
    - Represent 31.1% of entry-level BSN programs
    - Challenges with language and communication skills
  - *The effects of culture on language, communication, & perception*

## THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

- Theory of Cultural Variability
- *Hofstede (1980's) theory of cultural dimension*
  - *Triandis (1995)*
    - Individualism and Collectivism (IC)
      - *I versus we*
    - Horizontal and Vertical
      - *Horizontal : equality*
      - *Vertical: hierarchy*
      - Influence on incivility



## RESEARCH QUESTION 1

What is the difference in perception of staff nurse incivility between ESL nursing students and non-ESL nursing students?

- What is the difference in perceptions between ESL nursing students and non-ESL nursing students of hostile and mean behaviors (H-M) among staff nurses?
- What is the difference in perceptions between ESL nursing students and non-ESL nursing students of exclusionary behaviors (EXBEV) among staff nurses?

## RESEARCH QUESTION 2

How does dimensions of culture differ by student category ( ESL and non-ESL)?

- How does horizontal individualism (HI) scores differ by student category?
- How does vertical individualism (VI) scores differ by student category?
- How does horizontal collectivism (HC) scores differ by student category?
- How does vertical collectivism (VC) scores differ by student category?

## RESEARCH QUESTION 3

Which demographic variables best predict perceptions of incivility?

## METHODOLOGY

- Research design
- *Descriptive, cross-sectional, comparative and correlational*
- Sample
- *Convenience sampling*
  - *Members of the National Student Nurses' Association (NSNA)*
- Data Collection Plan
- *Mass broadcast email with an embedded video*
  - *Instruments*
    - Survey with three parts (Qualtrics)
      - *Demographic form*
      - *Uncivil Clinical Behavior in Nursing Education (UCBNE)*
      - *Horizontal and Vertical Individualism/Collectivism Scale*
- Data Management
- *Pre-analysis*
    - SPSS version 23
    - Coding
    - Missing data
      - *Management*
- Data Analysis
- *Descriptive*
    - Mean & Standard deviation
  - *Inferential*
    - Parametric tests
      - *t-test*
      - *Correlations*
      - *MANOVA*
      - *Multiple Regression*
- Inclusion criteria
- *Completion of al least on clinical rotation*
  - *Ability to read and understand English*
  - *Access to a computer and the Internet*
- Exclusion criteria
- *Self-report that they have been subjected to disciplinary action related to clinical performance*

## ANALYSIS OF RESEARCH QUESTIONS

- Research Question 1** What is the difference in perception of staff nurse incivility, hostile and mean behaviors, and exclusionary behaviors between ESL and non-ESL students?
- Exclusionary behaviors were significantly different
    - t-test  $p < .001$
  - Total incivility scores were statistically significantly different  $\alpha$ 
    - t-test  $p = .025$
  - However, the effect size of both significant findings was extremely low (little practical difference)

- Research Question 2** How do horizontal individualism, vertical individualism, horizontal collectivism, and vertical collectivism scores differ by ESL and non-ESL students?
- A significant result was found in the four scales between the two types of students (multivariate analysis:  $F = 2.866, p = .022$ )
  - Significant difference on vertical collectivism (univariate analysis:  $F = 5.33, p < .021$ )
  - However, the effect size of both significant findings was extremely low (little practical difference)

- Research Question 3** Which of the following variables (age, gender, race, student categories, and time in program) best predicts perceptions of incivility?

- Time in Program, age, and gender were significant predictors (*multiple regression using forward selection*  $F = 28.56, p < .01, \text{adjusted } R^2 = .078$ )
  - *Variables accounted for 7.8% of the variance*
  - *As student nurses' time in program and age increased so did their perceptions of incivility*
  - *Female student nurses were more likely to score higher on perceptions of incivility than were males*



## DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

- Differences in Perception of Staff Nurse Incivility between ESL and non-ESL Nursing Students**
- *The majority of nursing students reported uncivil behaviors that were "rarely" to "occasionally observed"*
    - Mateen (2014) concluded that 13.8% reported that they were verbally abused *occasionally* and 60% reported that they were bullied *occasionally*
    - Fern and Meerbeau (2009) reported that reporting verbal abuse practices were variable

- Dimensions of Culture as Predictors of Perceptions of Incivility**
- *ESL nursing students scored high in **vertical collectivism** scale*
    - See themselves as a part of a collective ( nursing students are a part the nursing collective)
    - Are willing to accept hierarchy (nursing students are on the bottom of the nursing hierarchy) and inequality within that collective
      - *might influence their willingness to accept incivility as normal behavior in clinical nursing education (Decker, et al., 2012; Magnavita and Hepomiemi, 2011)*
    - Values close relationships (like family or *familiasm*) within the group
      - *helps them develop resilience against stressors and makes it possible for many to tolerate or accept incivility from others (Welbourne et al., 2015)*

*It is possible ESL students are able use coping strategies learned from their vertical collectivism values to help manage their encounters with incivility*

- Age as a Predictor of Incivility**
- |                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                              |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Consistent</b>                                                                                                 | <b>Inconsistent</b>                                                                                                                          |
| ➤ <i>Generation differences influenced perceptions of incivility (Leiter, Price, and Spence-Laschinger, 2010)</i> | ➤ <i>Clark and Springer (2007), no difference between the ages of students on how they viewed examples of uncivil behaviors</i>              |
|                                                                                                                   | ➤ <i>Gallo (2012) and Clarke et al., (2012), demographic information such as age and gender, and perceptions of incivility had no effect</i> |

- Gender as a Predictor of Incivility**
- |                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                 |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Consistent</b>                                                                                                                         | <b>Inconsistent</b>                                                             |
| ➤ <i>Female nursing students report perceived incivility more frequently than males counterparts (Babenko-Mould and Laschinger, 2014)</i> | ➤ <i>Opposite findings reported from Clarke et al., (2012) and Gallo (2012)</i> |

- Time in Program as a Predictor of Incivility**
- Consistent**
- *Third and fourth year nursing students reported experiencing more bullying. (Clarke et al., 2012)*
  - *Students learn how to cope and accommodate, on a personal and organizational level, with horizontal violence as they progress through their education. (Curtis et al., 2007)*

- LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY**
- *Convenience sample*
    - results are reflective solely of the students who participated in the study
  - *Participants were unable to self-identify their ethnicity and/or ESL status;*
    - unequal representation of ESL/non-ESL groups
  - *Surveys are relatively superficial and do not clearly reflect the respondent's opinion*
    - can lead to self -reporting bias (Dillman et al., 2014)
  - *Unknown effect of response data from the almost 700 surveys that were omitted from analysis due to incomplete surveys*

- FUTURE RECOMMENDATIONS**
- Replicate the study and target schools of nursing with a large population of known ESL students
  - Explore the relationship between ESL students' collectivism values and how they cope with incivility in the clinical setting
  - Examine age, gender, and time in program separately along with their influence on ESL students' perception of incivility
  - Re-examine data from the current study using survey responses from subjects who had no more than 10% missing data