EVIDENCE-BASED HUMAN TRAFFICKING CURRICULUM FOR BSN STUDENTS: USE OF A MULTI-MODEL TEACHING METHODOLOGY

Amber Murray, DNP, MSN, MPH, PHNA-BC, RN
Public Health Program Director
College of Nursing and Health Sciences
Ashland University
Ashland, Ohio
SIGNIFICANCE OF PROBLEM

- **Human Trafficking:**
  - The illegal trade of human beings for sexual exploitation and forced labor resulting in profits for traffickers
- Violation of human rights
- Modern day form of slavery
- A multi-billion dollar business
- The fastest growing and one of the most lucrative crimes worldwide
- U.S. is one of the largest markets and primary destinations for victims worldwide
GLOBAL STATISTICS

- International Labour Organization:
  - Forced Labor Victims:
    - Almost 21 million people globally
  - Exploited by private individuals or enterprises
    - Almost 19 million victims globally
      - 4.5 million are victims of forced sexual exploitation
  - Exploited by state or rebel groups:
    - Over 2 million globally

INTERNATIONAL TO DOMESTIC

Trafficking of Persons, Especially Women and Children: USA Routes


Routes represent at least one documented case of trafficking of persons. See individual country reports for additional information.

Source: The Protection Project, Johns Hopkins University School of Advanced International Studies
Created by Neha Mathur
March 2002
As of September 13, 2017, the National Human Trafficking Resource Center hotline received reports of:
  • 4,460 human trafficking cases inside the U.S.
  • 13,897 calls
In 2016, the National Human Trafficking Resource Center hotline received reports of:
  • 7,621 human trafficking cases
  • 26,727 calls
In 2012, the National Human Trafficking resource Center hotline received reports of:
  • 3,272 human trafficking cases
  • 13,325

https://humantraffickinghotline.org/states
In 2016, the National Center for Missing & Exploited Children estimated that 1 in 6 endangered runaways were likely sex trafficking victims.
- 86% of these ST victims were in the care of social services or foster care when they ran away

http://www.missingkids.org/1in6
Most significant obstacle for rescue & treatment of victims is identification

- Reasons:
  - Global & domestic characteristics are inconsistent with one another
  - Victims comprise both adults and children
  - Human trafficking exists in various forms & accompanying signs & symptoms hinder detection
  - Lack of knowledge among HCP
Any contact with healthcare

88%
Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking (DMST) victims are perhaps the most difficult to recognize.

Misidentified as juvenile delinquents charged with drug possession.

Misidentified as habitual runaways.

I.e., 57% of runaway youth at a New Orleans runaway shelter were DMST victims; NONE were identified as such.

In Ohio’s five metropolitan cities of 115 DMST victims, only four victims (3.5%) were properly identified by a HCP. (Williamson et al., 2012).
What are the Needs of Trafficked Persons?

The following services delivered in a CULTURALLY COMPETENT, TRAUMA-SENSITIVE manner:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Safety</td>
<td>Basic Needs (Food, Clothing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safe, Temporary Housing</td>
<td>Residential Trauma Treatment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Care/Counseling</td>
<td>Permanent Housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive Case Management</td>
<td>Legal Advocacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workforce Development Training</td>
<td>Educational Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interpretation/Translation</td>
<td>Spiritual Services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alcohol &amp; Other Drug Treatment</td>
<td>Life Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culturally Appropriate Social Support</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SIGNIFICANCE TO NURSING EDUCATION

- Healthcare providers unaware of s/sx of human trafficking (IOM report, 2013)
  - IOM (2013) recommends HT training activities for HCP
- Traditional education within collegiate healthcare programs is ineffective
- Disparity between nursing education & nursing practice
  - Only 10% of nursing students are adequately prepared to provide safe & effective nursing care (Shin, Sok, Hyun, & Kim, 2014)
- Changes in nursing curriculum to correspond to current practice is essential
  - National League for Nursing confirms innovative teaching techniques are essential in BSN programs
SIGNIFICANCE TO NURSING EDUCATION cont...

- Integration of human trafficking content into BSN curriculum
  - Increases nursing knowledge and skills to properly ID human trafficking victims
STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

PICOT:

• “In undergraduate nursing students, how does a mixed method of teaching compared to a single method affect learning?”

Purpose of project is two-fold:

1) Literature review: search for most effective teaching method for BSN students to increase:
   1) Student Learning
   2) Critical Thinking
   3) Student Engagement

2) Determine whether an association exists between exposure to human trafficking material, using an evidence-based multimodal teaching method, and an increase in knowledge

• Student’s learning was evaluated for differences in knowledge using a pre- and post-test design
Theoretical Framework
- Kolb’s Experiential Learning Theory
  - Knowledge created through experience
  - Effective for nursing students by way of developing clinical judgment
  - Learning is a continuous process
  - Meets needs of all learners

Evidence-Based Practice Model
- Rosswurm & Larrabee Model
  - Guided development of the teaching intervention
Objective:
- Explore methods of teaching within undergraduate nursing programs
- Determine which teaching technique is most effective for maximum student engagement & learning
- Determine preeminent teaching technique to demonstrate efficacy when integrating human trafficking content within BSN curriculum

Evidence:
- Traditional teaching methods unaccompanied by innovative teaching strategies for BSN students has proven ineffective
  - Limits knowledge retention beyond classroom lecture
- National League for Nursing:
  - Advocates that nursing education become active, participatory, & experiential
Evidence supports active learning in BSN programs to:

- Increase student knowledge
- Increase student critical thinking
- Increase student engagement
- Increase student development

Active learning:
- Based on Kolb’s Experiential Learning Theory
- Multiple styles of teaching
  - Visual
  - Auditory
  - Kinesthetic
Types of Active Learning:

- Flipped classroom
- Simulation
- Problem-based learning
  - i.e., case studies
- Storytelling
- Gaming
- Videos
- Concept mapping
- Role-Playing
METHODS

Project Design

- Evidence-based education program
- Pre- and post-test design
- Inclusion/Exclusion Criteria
  - Senior level BSN students enrolled in PHN course
- Sampling Design
  - Non-probability based on a convenience sample
- Recruitment Procedures
  - All BSN students enrolled in the PHN course asked to participate in the pre- & post-test
  - Voluntary consent
- Sample Size
  - 38 Undergraduate, Traditional, BSN students
• Data Completeness
  • Response rate: 100%
  • Completion rate: 100%
• Instrument
  • Purpose:
    • Measure knowledge prior to & following teaching intervention to determine effectiveness of evidence-based teaching strategies
  • Questionnaire: 15 total questions
    • 4 multiple choice
    • 9 true/false
    • 2 Likert-scale questions
    • Demographics: gender, age, place of birth
  • Scoring based on a sum score of correct responses
  • Students given approximately 10 minutes to complete each
FINDINGS

- **Demographic Description of Sample:**
  - American-born citizens: 100%
  - Ohio-born citizens: 81.6%
  - Females: 92.1%
  - Males: 7.9%
  - Age: 100% between 21-25 years old
## McNemar Tests

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pre Q1 &amp; Post Q1</th>
<th>Pre Q2 &amp; Post Q2</th>
<th>Pre Q3 &amp; Post Q3</th>
<th>Pre Q4 &amp; Post Q4</th>
<th>Pre Q5 &amp; Post Q5</th>
<th>Pre Q6 &amp; Post Q6</th>
<th>Pre Q7 &amp; Post Q7</th>
<th>Pre Q8 &amp; Post Q8</th>
<th>Pre Q9 &amp; Post Q9</th>
<th>Pre Q10 &amp; Post Q10</th>
<th>Pre Q11 &amp; Post Q11</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>N</strong></td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>p-value</strong></td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.359</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td>.125</td>
<td>.774</td>
<td>.022</td>
<td>1.000</td>
<td>.687</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Paired Sample *t*-test & Effect Size

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Paired Samples Test</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Lower 95% Confidence Interval</th>
<th>Upper 95% Confidence Interval</th>
<th>Sig p-value</th>
<th>Cohen’s d</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Post-Pre Scores (Q1-Q13)</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-Pre ID Scores</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>.06</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Q5, 6, 9, 12)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q14 Post-Pre</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q15 Post-Pre</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>2.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DISCUSSION

- An association exists between exposure of human trafficking content and changes in knowledge acquisition

- Findings concur with evidence-based practice:
  - Active learning teaching techniques increase student knowledge and facilitate students to build on previous existing knowledge
DISCUSSION cont...

- Increase in overall knowledge at the completion of the project
  - Improvement on 6 of the 15 questions

- Increase in knowledge and confidence levels related to:
  - Ability to properly identify signs and symptoms of human trafficking
  - Victimization of human trafficking
CONCLUSION

- Recognition of s/sx of human trafficking and proper identification of victims presents challenges to the healthcare profession
- Nurses have not been adequately trained to properly assess, identify, and treat victims of human trafficking
- Nurse educators are faced with challenges to properly educate students to increase:
  - Critical thinking
  - Student engagement
  - Student development
Active learning has been widely supported as an effective teaching strategy.

Active learning strategies demonstrated an overall improvement in nursing student competencies within this project.

Nursing students should be educated about human trafficking using active learning teaching strategies:
- To provide effective nursing care
- To promote human rights among nursing clients
- To support social justice among nursing clients
REFERENCES

REFERENCES


REFERENCES


