Upwards Violence in Nursing: A Scoping Review of a Phenomenon of Importance for Nursing

Alice Gaudine¹, Linda Patrick², and Lorraine Busby¹

¹Memorial University of Newfoundland
²University of Windsor
Disclaimer

• We are employed full time in academic institutions in Canada

• We are not endorsing any programs, software or products in this presentation, but we did use the Joanna Briggs Institute Methodology for the Scoping Review

• We have no financial relationships to disclose
Objectives of Presentation

1) to define and to describe upwards violence

2) to present the methods and findings of a scoping review on upwards violence

3) to identify implications for nursing practice, research and education
Background

- Upward Violence
- Little research
- Power differential
- May begin with incivility and escalate

- Nursing students to nursing instructor
- Nurse to nurse manager
- Nursing faculty members towards the Director
• Important because outcomes may include:
  – people not going into leadership roles
  – toxic work environment, low job satisfaction
  – turnover, high absenteeism, stress
Scoping Review Objectives

• **Overall objective**
  – to understand what is known about upwards violence in the workplace

• **Specific objectives**
  – 1) to frame key issues related to upwards violence in the workplace
  
  – 2) to identify implications for nursing practice and research.
Scoping Review Question

What is known about upwards violence in the workplace?
Inclusion Criteria

— Participants

• leaders who have been the targets of violence of any form from employees who report to them in the organization.

— Concept

• upwards violence in the workplace, which is violence directed towards persons who have authority based on their organizational role over the person who directed the violence towards them.

— Context

• employees supervising other employees in the workplace who direct violence towards them.
Study Types

– All research designs and grey literature

– Published in English

– Emphasis is on literature published in 2000 or later
3 Step Search Strategy

1) CINAHL and Medline search followed by analysis of text words in title and abstract and index terms

2) full search strategy in different databases

3) screen reference lists of selected studies/grey literature
Methodology

• PRISMA flow diagram

• Charting form piloted

• Each document reviewed by two team members

• Disagreements reviewed by third member

• Data extracted using a table
PRISMA 2009 Flow Diagram

- Records identified through database searching \( n = 37 \)
- Additional records identified through other sources \( n = 12 \)
- Records after duplicates removed \( n = 34 \)
- Records screened \( n = 34 \)
  - Records excluded \( n = 7 \)
  - Full-text articles assessed for eligibility \( n = 27 \)
    - Full-text articles excluded, with reasons \( n = 5 \)
- Studies included in review \( n = 22 \)
- Results and Conclusions
Form for Charting the Results

Review question:

• What is known about upwards violence in nursing and other workplaces?
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) Title</td>
<td>5) Author(s)’ stated (or implied) purpose of the manuscript</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Citation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Database</td>
<td>6) Description of study participants (if applicable)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) Country where study conducted or publication written</td>
<td>7) Number of study participants (if applicable)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8) Description of work context (if applicable)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Charting of the results form cont’d

9) a) Study methodology
   
   b) If not a research study, source of information

10) a) Upwards violence named in manuscript  Yes [ ]
     No [ ]

   b) Upwards violence described in manuscript using a different term
     • provide terms used
Charting of the results form cont’d

11) Antecedents of upwards violence

12) Description of upwards violence

13) Outcomes of upwards violence

14) Additional comments of reviewer
# Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Study/ manuscript type</th>
<th>Organizational context/ country</th>
<th>Antecedents of upwards violence</th>
<th>Characteristics/ description of upwards violence</th>
<th>Outcomes of upwards violence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Findings - Antecedent Themes

- Unrealistic expectations upon leader
- Leader not accepted/resented by followers
- Lack of support from leader’s superiors
- Entitled followers
- Inappropriate behaviours of follower or leader
- Workplace environment
  - Leader may be dependent on followers
  - Change/uncertainty/stress/conflict in workplace
Description Themes

– Group mobbing
  • Rallying others including unions

– Usually a negative spiral

– Rude, disrespectful, threatening behaviours
  • Rumours, gossip, scrutiny of leader

– Sabotage
  • Bypassing leader’s decisions
  • Disruptive behavior, tardiness, withholding information

– Initiated more frequently by males
Description Themes cont’d

– Prevalence – underreported (8.3% in one study)

– Duration – 1 month – 3 years

– Leaders most at risk are those most accessible to followers
Outcome Themes

- Resignation of leader
- Damaged reputation of leader
- Leaders feel powerless, isolated, threatened, stress, questions themselves
- Damaged community relationships

- Organizational productivity weakened
  - Bypassing leader’s decisions
  - Decreased teamwork/engagement at work
- Litigation and relocation costs
Implications for Nursing Practice

– Nurse leaders need to be prepared for managing upwards violence

– Nursing leaders need support when upwards violence occurs

– Nursing profession needs to address standards of acceptable workplace interactions
Implications for Nursing Education

—Nursing faculty need to be prepared for managing upwards violence

—Nursing faculty need support when upwards violence occurs

—Courses on issues in the nursing profession can include information on all types of violence, and promote self-reflection about one’s own and other’s behaviour
Implications for Research

– Further study of antecedents of upwards violence

– Interventions to decrease upwards violence

– Improved standards of professional practice in nursing
Acknowledgement

• We acknowledge the mentorship of the Queen's Collaboration for Health Care Quality (QcHcQ): A JBI Centre of Excellence.
Literature Cited
