Finding meanings: Using photovoice to explore smoking in rural low-income women

Star A. Mitchell, PhD, RN, CCRN
Undergraduate Program Director and Assistant Professor
St. David’s School of Nursing
Disclosure Statement

- Star Mitchell is employed at Texas State University and has no financial or commercial interest related to this content. There is no sponsorship to report.

- This study was approved by The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill Institutional Review Board.
Objectives

• Discuss the need for creative research data collection in disadvantaged and marginalized populations that have not responded to current smoking cessation interventions.

• Explain how photovoice, from a relativist perspective, was used in this study to expand our understanding of the meaning of smoking within the social context of rural low-income women.

• Summarize social and cultural factors that give meaning to smoking in rural low-income women and how this knowledge may be useful in the design of smoking interventions that target low-income women living in disadvantaged rural areas.
Acknowledgment of Committee

Shawn Kneipp (Chair)
Linda Beeber
Cheryl Giscombe
George Noblit
Pam Kulbok
Purpose of the Study

• Explore the meaning of smoking from the perspective of rural low-income women that smoke and the relationships this meaning has to their social identity, contextual sociocultural factors, social networks, and smoking behavior.
What’s in the literature

- Descriptive statistics
  - *How many, Who, How much*
- Randomized control studies
  - *Cessation programs*
- Correlational
  - *Race, Ethnicity, Gender, etc.*
- Qualitative
  - *Social support, social networks, and smoking cessation*

---

The Disconnect

- Between desired intervention programs & what is available

- Cultural and social meanings & values associated with smoking
  - their impact on decisions to smoke or quit

“Bein’ silly at home... bored” (Mary)
Rural Smoking

- General smoking factors
- Rurality
- Sociocultural and economic factors
- Women and smoking

Smoking in low-income rural women

– Smoking rates remain high
  • Pregnancy: 27.4%:11.2% (rural:urban)

– Disproportionate level of tobacco related disease & health burden
  • Cervical, colorectal, and lung cancers; COPD (NCI, 2016)
  • Tobacco-related morbidity and mortality from own smoking and 2nd hand smoke (RHPv1,2015)
  • Children

“Geographic variation and diverse populations should be included in our discussions on health disparities...” Robert Croyle, PhD, National Cancer Institute, May 18th, 2016
New Approaches, Old Problem

– Widening health disparities linked to social structures and economic systems
  • *IOM Workshops on Measuring the Risks and Causes of Premature Death, 2015*
  • *World Health Organization, 2010*
  • *National Research Council & Institute of Medicine, 2015*
  • *Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2011*
  • *Healthy People 2020*
New Approaches, Old Problem

– Call for innovative investigational approaches (WHO, 2010)

• Contextual factors
• Cultural roots
• Social economic factors
• Resources
• Power
• Policy
Theoretical Foundations

• Meanings
  – Social theorist.. Blumer (1969); Mead (1934)

• Social networks & health
  – Berkman & Glass (2000); House, et al. (1988);
    Smith & Christakis (2008)

• Marginalization and stigma
  – Link & Phelan (2001); Stuber, et al. (2009)
Philosophical Assumptions

• **Realist**
  – Cause-effect relationship of phenomena
  – Context free and enduring
  – Findings are empirical in nature, researcher has unattached relationship with phenomena of inquiry

• **Relativist**
  – Temporal and contextual nature of phenomena
  – Generalizations not feasible
  – Findings acknowledge influential reactivity between phenomena and investigator
Methods

• Interpretive focused ethnographic
  – Reflexively map multiple discourses occurring within the social space of the human experience (Denzin, 1996)
    • Observations, Artifacts, Interviews with locals, Community events, Vapor rooms/tobacco stores
    • Detailed Field notes, Memos

• Photovoice
  – Participant generated photographs
  – Photo elicited interviews
    • Participants select and interpret photos
  – Participatory
    • Empowerment

"Waitin’ on a ride...." (Journey)
Setting and Sample

- Three rural counties
  - ↑ smoking rates, poverty, unemployment
- Enrollment criteria
  - Age 24-65
  - US Census Bureau Poverty Guidelines
  - English
  - Smoked 100 cigarettes during lifetime, current smoker
  - Physically able to operate digital camera
- Recruitment
- Confidentiality and compensation
- 13 completed the study (17 enrolled)
Data Collection

• Phase I
  – Community observations

• Phase II
  – Enrollment, 1st semi-structured interview, Guidelines for photos

• Phase III
  – 2nd interview using photo-elicitation
Demographics

• 11 African Americans-2 Whites
• 12 Menthol smokers
• Average age: 44 (26-57)
• Average start age: 18 (13-24)
• Smoke: 5 cigarettes – 1 pack/day
• 8 live with other smokers
• 8 have quit in past or made effort to quit
Data Analysis

• Reading the narratives, photos, notes, memos
• Narrative Coding
  – Descriptive, thematic, theoretical
  – Experiences, relationships, beliefs, behaviors
• Photograph Coding
  – Context of photos
  – Power relationships
• Co-coder
Common Themes

• Rural life is hard
  – Poor employment opportunities
  – Violence in communities

• Feelings of isolation
  – Stigma and shame
  – Limits due to geographic location

• Struggling day to day
  – Poverty
  – Limited social resources

• It’s relaxing
  – “just breath”
Common Themes

• “Looking good” and empowerment
  – Identity, self efficacy, and acculturation

• Family support and expectations
  – Discourse between getting and giving

• Being a good mother
  – Providing for children
  – Role modeling

• Hope for a better life
  – “Once things get better I’ll quit”

At my step mother’s house outside having a smoke break... (Bug)
“Driving while smoking. Kids in the car. Windows down” (Kim)

Anything in the pictures you would change? “I wish I didn't smoke in the car with the kids but I try to always have the windows down, because I know the secondhand smoke......that’s about it, kids being in the car.
“Payin’ bills”
*(Deasia & her mother Journey)*

What is it you like about the picture? “...because I like taking pictures of my mama because of her condition and I want her to feel just as pretty as I feel”
Discussion

• “The social determinants of health are the circumstances in which people are born, grow up, live, work and age, and the systems put in place to deal with illness.”

• “These circumstances are in turn shaped by a wider set of forces: economics, social policies, and politics.”

Discussion

• Social determinants
  – Power vs empowerment
  – Poverty vs opportunity
  – Social isolation vs social engagement
  – Community desert vs community resources

• “Place”
  – Geographic
  – Access
  – Infrastructure
  – Exposure and hazards
  – Barriers

Healthy People 2020 Social Determinants of Health
https://www.healthypeople.gov/2020/topics-objectives/topic/social-determinants-of-health
Implications for Intervention Design

• Meaningful support
  – Social support sources
  – Coping: “stop and take a breath”
  – Value of family
  – Breath work?
Implications for Intervention Design

• Hope and empowerment
  – Stop the stigma
  – Increase sense of hope and agency
  – Membership in community organizations
Thank you!

To all the ladies that participated and welcomed me into their homes!

“Hello Gorgeous ....”
Questions or Comments

References provided upon request: sam418@txstate.edu