The Effect of Leadership and Staffing Adequacy on Nurse Coworker Incivility in Hospitals

Jessica G. Smith, PhD, RN
Karen H. Morin, PhD, RN ANEF, FAAN
Eileen T. Lake, PhD, RN, FAAN
Aim

- To determine how nurse coworker incivility was associated with the hospital nurse work environment, namely nurse manager effectiveness and nurse staffing adequacy.
Nurse Incivility Defined

- Workplace incivility is “the occurrence of low intensity behavior exhibiting an ambiguous intent to harm”
- Examples: “…gossiping and spreading rumors, refusing to assist coworkers, name-calling, and public criticism.”

Nurse Incivility Background

- **Antecedents:** Organizational (i.e. structure, culture, politics)

- **Consequences:** Decreased patient safety perceptions, nurse turnover, financial loss for hospitals, poor mental health of nurses

- **Must be addressed:**
  - Joint Commission Statement 2008
  - ANA Position Statement 2015
An Ongoing Problem


- 86.2% of nurse managers and leaders witnessed nurse bullying
- Recognize nurse bullying more than intervening
- Intervene more often if bullying is overt rather than covert
Nurse Work Environment Background

- Concept first defined by Lake (2002) in the creation of a measurement tool: Practice Environment Scale of the Nursing Work Index (PES-NWI)
- Nurse-to-nurse bullying is thought to result in a “toxic work environment” among other deleterious effects (Gilbert et al., 2016)
- But what about the effect of practice environments on nurse incivility? How does the nurse practice environment relate to nurse coworker incivility as an outcome?
Exemplar: Nurse Work Environment and Bullying


- Being bullied “weekly” or “daily” associated with low scores on two work environment domains:
  - Nurse manager ability, leadership, and support of nurses
  - Staffing and resource adequacy
Conceptual Framework: Donabedian

Hospital System

Structure:
- Nurse manager effectiveness
- Staffing adequacy

Process-Outcome:
Coworker Incivility

Patient, Nurse, & Hospital Outcomes
Methods

- Quantitative, cross-sectional, descriptive, and correlational.

- Online surveys were completed by registered nurses working in inpatient settings in a southwestern U.S. health system comprising five hospitals.

- Survey content included the National Quality Forum-endorsed Practice Environment Scale of the Nursing Work Index (PES-NWI) and the Workplace Incivility Scale.
Descriptive Results

- 283 surveys submitted
- N=233 usable surveys (formerly N=212)
  - 43% of nurses had <1 to 2 years of experience
  - 35% of nurses were from 20 to 30 years of age
  - 74% held a bachelor of science in nursing
  - 27% from critical-progressive care units
  - 25% from medical surgical units
  - 93% were working full time
Major Results: Incivility

- Levels of incivility were low in this sample of 233 staff nurses.
- Incivility occurred “sporadically” (mean = .58; range 0 to 5.29).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items to measure coworker incivility</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Put you down or was condescending to you?</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paid little attention to your statement or showed little interest in your opinion?</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Made demeaning or derogatory remarks about you?</td>
<td>0.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Addressed you in unprofessional terms, either publicly or privately?</td>
<td>0.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ignored or excluded you from professional camaraderie?</td>
<td>0.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doubted your judgment on a matter over which you have responsibility?</td>
<td>0.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Made unwanted attempts to draw you into a discussion of personal matters?</td>
<td>0.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coworker Incivility Mean Score</td>
<td>0.58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Major Results: Nurse Work Environment

- The work environment was rated highly (mean = 3.10; range of 1.00 to 4.00).
Nurse Work Environment and Nurse Incivility

- Positive perceptions of the nurse work environment were inversely associated with coworker incivility scores.
- Nurse manager effectiveness was the principal factor of the work environment associated with incivility.
Nurse Work Environment and Nurse Incivility

Correlation Analysis

Nurse Incivility

Nurse Work Environment

Incivility

work environment
## Relationships Between Nurse Work Environment and Incivility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nurse Work Environment Items</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>r</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PES-NWI Composite</td>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>-0.42**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse Manager Ability, Leadership, and Support</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>-0.38**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staffing and Resource Adequacy</td>
<td>2.92</td>
<td>-0.29**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse Participation in Hospital Affairs</td>
<td>3.07</td>
<td>-0.42**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nursing Foundations for Quality of Care</td>
<td>3.23</td>
<td>-0.35**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collegial Nurse-Physician Relations</td>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>-0.26**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Linear Regression: Nurse Work Environment and Incivility

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Incivility</th>
<th>Model 1</th>
<th>Model 2</th>
<th>Model 3</th>
<th>Model 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PES-NWI composite</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
<td>$b$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse Manager Leadership</td>
<td>$-.33^{**}$</td>
<td></td>
<td>$-.30^{**}$</td>
<td>$-.25^{**}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staffing and Resource Adequacy</td>
<td></td>
<td>$-.23^{**}$</td>
<td></td>
<td>$-.09$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Estimated Scores of Incivility with Management and Staffing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nurse Manager Leadership %</th>
<th>Incivility Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>0.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75</td>
<td>0.44</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Implications for Nursing Management

- Nurse managers are pivotal in addressing nurse incivility
- Ensuring adequate nurse staffing should be a top priority
  Research to improve nurse work environment should include before-and after measures of coworker incivility
Conclusion

- The nurse work environment is associated with decreased coworker incivility.
- Nurses’ work environments warrant the attention of hospital administrators to achieve civil workplaces where nurses can focus their attention on patient care.
Acknowledgements

• Dr. Christine Kovach, PhD, RN, FAAN
• Dr. Leigh Wallace, PhD
• Dr. Susan Houston, PhD, RN, FAAN

Presenter Contact Information:
▪ Jessica Smith, PhD, RN
▪ smje@nursing.upenn.edu