Mwende Kabotu: Going with Cultural Humility for International Nursing Student Experiences

Wanda Thuma-McDermond, PhD, RN
Faculty Disclosure

• Faculty name: Wanda Thuma-McDermond, PhD, RN
• Conflicts of Interest: None
• Employer: Messiah College, Department of Nursing, Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania, USA
• Sponsorship/Commercial Support: $1200 Faculty Development Travel Grant from employer.
Goals and Objectives:

• Session Goal:
  • The purpose of this presentation is to share the efficacy of going with cultural humility in international nursing student experiences.

• Session objectives:
  1. The learner will be able to recognize the concept of cultural humility as it pertains to cross-cultural interactions, especially in an international setting, from accepted, current definition references.
  2. The learner will be able to analyze the efficacy of cultural humility through the presentation of a qualitative research project.
I. Introduction: Cultural humility definitions

- Cultural humility is best defined ...as a commitment and active engagement in a lifelong process that individuals enter into on an ongoing basis with patients, communities, colleagues, and with themselves...a process that requires humility in how we bring into check the power imbalances that exist in the dynamics of communication (Tervalon & Murray-Garcia, 1998).

- Model of Cultural Competence - “journey” to “cultural competence” with “cultural desire” (Campinha-Bacote, 2002)
Cultural humility, cont.

• Does not require mastery of lists of different cultures & peculiar health beliefs & behaviors.
• Entails developing a respectful partnership with diverse individuals, groups & communities.
• Sees the individual or community as rich experts; teachers on the content of their culture.
• Includes addressing power relations, especially power imbalances, & marginalization.
• No end result, with which those in academia & medical fields struggle! However...
• Encourages lifelong learning; with an appreciation of the journey of growth & understanding.

(Tervalon & Murray-Garcia, 1998)
II. Qualitative research project:

• The first purpose was to explore, through a focused ethnographic approach, American nursing students’ perceptions of cultural competence and social justice during an international clinical immersion experience in rural Zambia, that focused on health disparities and global health issues.
Purposes of the study, cont.:

• A second purpose was to examine the perceptions of cultural competence and social justice of Zambian nursing students and tutors at the clinical immersion site.

• A third purpose was to gain an understanding of the relationship of cultural competence to social justice during an international clinical immersion experience.
Research Questions:

1. What are the perceptions of cultural competence and social justice of American baccalaureate nursing students participating in an international clinical immersion experience focused on global health issues and disparities?

2. What are the perceptions of cultural competence and social justice of nursing students and their tutors who reside at the international clinical immersion site?

3. How does cultural competence relate to social justice during an international clinical immersion experience?
Application of methodology:

- Researcher as Instrument: participant-as-observer was the main research role
  - Researcher as educator balanced by journaling, and log or paper trail
- Focus Group Interviews: for data collection of students’ perceptions
  - Fifteen focus group questions tailored for American students, Zambian students, and Zambian tutors.
Setting: Macha Mission Hospital
Nurses’ Training School
Procedures for Data Collection:

- IRB approval
- Approval from management team at Macha Mission Hospital
- Two-phase timeline
  - January – February 2008 with American students
  - June 2008 with Zambian students and tutors
American Sample:

- Convenience sample of n=10 American undergraduate senior nursing students in an alternate senior practicum, January 2008 in Zambia
  - M (age) = 21.5 years
  - Caucasian
  - Female
Zambian Sample:

- Zambian nursing students and tutors at Macha Mission Hospital in June 2008
- Junior nursing students n=27
  - M (age) = 22.1 years
  - M:F = 10:17
- Senior nursing students n=24
  - M (age) = 21.5 years
  - M:F = 8:16
- Tutors n=4
  - M (age) = 39.0 years
  - M:F = 2:2
Data Analysis:

• Recordings of focus groups transcribed and analyzed for emergent themes
• Similar narrative analysis of students’ journals and papers for emergent themes
• Labeling of themes
• Summary of emergent themes
American students’ themes:

**Cultural Competence**

During experience
- Being intentionally aware, sensitive, & respectful of others
  - Acting with reflective self-knowledge
  - Being more self aware
- Asking with respectful curiosity to learn about the culture
  - Sharing knowledge with mutuality

**Social Justice**

During experience
- Maintaining personhood with fair treatment
  - Professional intentionality
  - Wistful wishing for change
  - Maintaining holistic personhood
American students’ themes

Cultural Competence  
Post experience  
• Experiencing sensitivity with a kaleidoscope twist  
• Coming alongside with humility

Social Justice  
Post experience  
• Re-evaluating lifestyle choices out of respect
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zambian themes:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cultural Competence</strong></td>
<td><strong>Social Justice</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Nursing students</td>
<td>• Nursing students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <em>Behaving effectively to act “as a nurse”</em></td>
<td>• <em>Behaving effectively to act “as a nurse”</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tutors</td>
<td>• Tutors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• <em>Professional intentionality through education</em></td>
<td>• <em>Teaching etiquette and behavioral norms</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion of findings:

- Research Question #1 (American students)
  - Cognitive & affective
  - Emic view
  - Intentionality
  - Twist of the kaleidoscope
  - Cultural humility
- Research Question #2 (Zambian students & tutors)
  - Merging of concepts
  - Cultural competence is professional behavior
  - “It is doing the best for all – as a nurse.”
Discussion of findings:

• Research Question #3 - Connections
• American students
  • Emic view, with self awareness, aids cultural sensitivity and competence, which in turn aids implementation of social justice.
• Zambian students and tutors
  • Professional competence is practicing “as a nurse” which incorporates cultural competence and social justice.
Thesis Conclusions:

• Cultural Humility versus Cultural Competence
  • *Continue efforts for cross-cultural understanding of cultural diversity from a cultural humility approach*

• The Kaleidoscope Effect for nursing education
III. Efficacy of cultural humility

- 10 cross-cultural/international courses since 2008
  - Incorporation & discussion of concept pre-departure
  - Intentional effort to learn from hosts
  - Sharing knowledge
  - “mwende kabotu”
  - “go well”
REFERENCES:
