Fostering Healthy Work Environments:
Powered by Civility, Collegiality, and Teamwork

Cynthia Clark PhD, RN, ANEF, FAAN
STTI 43rd Biennial Convention; Las Vegas, NV
Gratitude!
Today’s Objectives

- Summarize the ‘State of the Science’ regarding civility and incivility in nursing
- Describe the impact of workplace incivility on individuals, teams, organizations, and patient care
- Present an evidence-based pathway to create and sustain healthy work environments
Knowing what’s right doesn’t mean much unless you do what’s right.

Theodore Roosevelt

When we are on the receiving end of an act of civility, we feel validated, valued, and it gives our life meaning.

PM Forni [Choosing Civility, 2002]
Background and Definitions
Authentic respect for others requiring time, presence, engagement, and an intention to seek common ground. Clark & Carnosso (2008)
What is Incivility?

A range of rude or disruptive behaviors or failing to take action when action is warranted; these behaviors and inactions may result in **psychological or physiological distress** for the people involved— and if left unaddressed, may progress into threatening situations [or result in temporary or permanent illness or injury]. (Clark, 2009, 2013, Clark & Kenski, in press)
Behaviors range from:

non-verbal sarcasm bullying racial/ethnic slurs intimidation mobbing physical violence tragedy behaviors (eye-rolling)

Clark © 2009, revised 2013, 2015
# Scaffolding Harmful Behavior in the Workplace

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Mobbing</strong></th>
<th>Extreme form of intentional and collective [group] bullying behavior aimed at marginalizing, excluding, or expelling another</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bullying</strong></td>
<td>A repeated, usually intentional, and targeted pattern of abusive, threatening, or demeaning behavior designed to intimidate, degrade, and humiliate another—often a power imbalance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Incivility</strong></td>
<td>Rude or disruptive behavior or failing to take action when action is warranted. Generally considered to be selfishly motivated and perceived to be less threatening than bullying or mobbing behavior</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ANA, 2015; Griffin & Clark, 2014; Clark in progress
Common Incivilities

Withholding important information
Rude or demeaning remarks
Using anger and intimidation
Spreading rumors and gossiping
Failing to support a co-worker; setting up to fail
Neglecting, marginalizing or excluding a co-worker
Breaking confidences
Name calling, put-downs, and offensive sarcasm
Encouraging others to turn against a co-worker

(Dellasega, 2009, 2012; Clark 2013; Griffin, 2004, Griffin & Clark, 2014)
What Motivates Uncivil Behavior

Unaware of how behavior affects others
Learned behavior ("it works")—school yard bullies
Extreme need to win at all costs
Lack of social and emotional intelligence
Ineffective communication and conflict negotiation skills
Find pleasure in demeaning others
Attention seeking
Believe bullying needed to change behavior or motivate others
Institutional acceptance of incivility
Jealousy and envy (often of high-achievers)
Social influence (online environment, reality TV)
Aligning with those perceived to have power
Rationale for Fostering Civility

Provision 1.5: The nurse creates an ethical environment and culture of civility and kindness, treating colleagues, coworkers, employees, students, and patients with dignity and respect; any form of bullying, harassment, intimidation, manipulation, threats, or violence are always morally unacceptable and will not be tolerated.

Provision 3: The nurse promotes, advocates for, and protects the rights, health, and safety of the patient.
Future of Nursing: Leading Change, Advancing Health
Institute of Medicine (IOM) Report (2011)

Recommendation 2: Expand opportunities for nurses to lead and diffuse collaborative efforts to improve work environments and health care systems

Recommendation 7: Prepare and enable nurses to lead change to advance health
STANDARD 11: COMMUNICATION
Communicates effectively in a variety of formats in all areas of practice. The nurse assesses his or her own communications skills with patients, families, and co-workers while improving personal communication and conflict resolution skills.

STANDARD 12: LEADERSHIP
Demonstrates leadership in the professional practice setting and the profession. Requires nurses to treat co-workers with respect, trust and dignity.

STANDARD 13: COLLABORATION
Collaborates with the healthcare consumer, family, and others in the conduct of nursing practice. The nurse uses effective: conflict management/resolution, engagement, consensus building, and adheres to codes of conduct and behaviors that foster cooperation, respect, and trust.
Bookends of Civility
The Joint Commission Sentinel Event Alert
(Issued July 2008 — Effective January 2009)

Health care is “high-stakes, pressure-packed environment that can test the limits of civility in the workplace.”

Rude, uncivil behavior among health care professionals poses a serious threat to patient safety and the overall quality of care.

All accredited health care organizations need to create behavioral codes of conduct and establish a formal process for managing unacceptable behavior.
Boards of Nursing

Sanctions for Academic Incivility

• Nursing programs are required to develop a defined set of expectations, interventions, strategies and written policies “to improve the culture of academic civility.”

• And to produce evidence of a “respectful, confidential, positive and productive academic environment and improved student-faculty relationships and communication to ensure student success.”
Impact of Incivility

- Weakens confidence and moral courage
- Impairs clinical judgment and critical thinking
- Increases forgetfulness, poor concentration
- Creates vulnerability, self-doubt
- Erodes self-esteem and diminishes human dignity
- Causes anxiety, resentment, and anger
- Damages relationships
- Increases stress; weakens immunity
- Causes conflict; threatens collaboration and collegiality
- Seriously threatens quality of life

Impact on the Organization
Negatively Impacts

Patient Safety and Quality Care
Recruitment and Retention
Morale and Collegiality
Job Satisfaction—Intent to Leave
Relationships and Teamwork
Quality of Services
The ‘Bottom Line’
Heavy Financial Burden

$23.8 billion annually to cover direct and indirect cost associated with uncivil and violent workplace behaviors

$11,581 per nurse annually to cover lost productivity due to workplace incivility

GOAL

To establish and sustain a civil, healthy work environment
Clark Healthy Workplace Inventory®
1. Members of the organization ‘live’ by a shared vision and mission based on trust, respect, and collegiality
2. There is a clear and discernible level of trust between and among formal leadership and other members of the workplace
3. Communication at all levels of the organization is transparent, clear, and respectful
4. Employees are viewed as assets and valued partners within the organization
5. Individual and collective achievements are celebrated and publicized
6. There is a high level of employee satisfaction, engagement, and morale
7. The organizational culture is assessed on an ongoing basis, and measures are taken to improve the workplace culture based on the results of the assessment
8. Members of the organization are actively engaged in shared governance, joint decision-making, and policy development, review, and revision
9. Teamwork and collaboration are promoted and are evident
10. There is a comprehensive mentoring program for all employees
11. There is an emphasis on wellness and self-care
12. There are sufficient resources for professional growth and development
13. Employees are treated in a fair and respectful manner
14. Workload is reasonable, manageable, and fairly distributed
15. Members of the organization employ effective conflict-resolution skills and address disagreements in a respectful and responsible manner
16. The organization encourages free expression of diverse, and/or opposing ideas and perspectives
17. The organization provides competitive salaries, benefits, and other compensations and rewards
18. There are opportunities for promotion and career advancement
19. The organization attracts and retains the ‘best and brightest’
20. The majority of employees would recommend the organization as a good or great place to work to their family and friends
Scoring the Clark Healthy Workplace Inventory©

Add up your ‘TRUE’ responses—score your ‘HWI’

18-20 (90%)—Very healthy
16-17 (80%)—Moderately healthy
14-15 (70%)—Mildly healthy
12-13 (60%)—Barely healthy
10-12 (50%)—Unhealthy
Less than 10—Very unhealthy
CIVILITY: Lifeblood of a Healthy Work Environment
LEADERSHIP: Heart of a Healthy Work Environment

P.E.A.K. Leadership to Foster Civility

Principled Ethical Authentic Kind

Leadership at ALL Levels
Authentic Leadership Requires **Self-Awareness**

Knowing and understanding:
- Our strengths and areas for improvement
- Our impact on others and the organization

Reflecting upon:
- Who we really are at the deepest level
- Our emotions, motives, goals, and core values

Avolio, Walumbwa, & Weber, 2009
Self-Reflection

Without awareness, nothing will change
Self-Assessment
Clark Workplace Civility Index®
1. Assume goodwill and think the best of others
2. Include and welcome new and current colleagues
3. Communicate respectfully (e-mail, telephone, face to face) and really listen
4. Avoid gossip and spreading rumors
5. Keep confidences and respect others’ privacy
6. Encourage and mentor others
7. Avoid abusing position or authority
8. Use respectful language (no racial, ethnic, sexual, age, religiously-biased terms)
9. Attend meetings, arrive on time, participate, volunteer, and share the work
10. Avoid distracting others (misusing media, side conversations) during meetings
11. Avoid taking credit for someone else’s ideas/work/contributions
12. Acknowledge others and praise their ideas/work/contributions
13. Take personal responsibility and accountability for my actions
14. Speak directly to the person with whom I have an issue
15. Share pertinent or important information with others
16. Uphold the vision, mission, and values of the organization
17. Seek and encourage constructive feedback from others
18. Demonstrate approachability, flexibility, openness to other points of view
19. Bring my ‘A’ Game and a strong work ethic to my workplace
20. Apologize and mean it when the situation calls for it
Scoring the Clark Workplace Civility Index©

Add up your ‘Yes’ responses—score your ‘civility index’

18-20 (90%)—Very civil
16-17 (80%)—Moderately civil
14-15 (70%)—Mildly civil
12-13 (60%)—Barely civil
10-12 (50%)—Uncivil
Less than 10—Very uncivil

Are you satisfied with your civility score?
EVIDENCED-BASED STRATEGIES
Civility is a Decision... however, for nurses, it’s a personal commitment to uphold the ANA Professional Code of Ethics (2015)
Positive Role Modeling

Lead By Example
Mentoring and Coaching
Reengineering the Organizational Culture
“If your foundation is laid on shifting sand, you may build your house, but it will tumble down” Florence Nightingale
8-Step Pathway for Fostering Organizational Civility© [PFOC]
Step 1—Raise Awareness and Enlist Leadership Support

- Shake up the status quo—create interest
- Boldly address incivility and generate solutions
- Engage leaders and key stakeholders
Step 2: Measure Civility, Teamwork, and Workplace Health

- Conduct assessments and measurements
- Determine interventions and an action plan based on strengths and areas for growth
Step 3: Assemble a Civility Team

Members: Trusted and Empowered to:

- Lead the co-creation of a compelling vision of the future
- Facilitate organizational assessment
- Develop and implement a ‘Civility’ Action Plan
High Performing Teams
The Backbone of Organizational Health
Establish **Unambiguous** Vision and Mission Statements, Shared Values, and Behavioral Norms (Ground Rules)
Sigma Theta Tau International Vision and Mission Statement

VISION: To be the global organization of choice for nursing.

Mission: Advancing world health and celebrating nursing excellence in scholarship, leadership, and service.
Statement of Shared Values

Example

Superior Patient Safety and Quality Care
Professional Excellence
Holistic Caring and Ethical Practice
Integrity and Accountability
Respect for All
Social Justice
Teamwork and Collaboration
Team Charter

[Commitment, Pledge, Promise]
Commitment to Coworkers: Exemplar

Our department/organization is dedicated to creating and maintaining a safe, civil, healthy work environment that supports respectful behavior and communication, openness to opposing points of view, dignity toward all, and an unequivocal commitment to patient safety and quality care.

We pledge our display mutual regard, willingness to listen, compliance with norms of decorum, and respectful interactions. We commit to fostering a healthy work environment that promotes respect, teamwork, and collaboration among all members of the organization. When we disagree, we will restrict our differences to the issue itself while continuing to respect the person with whom we disagree and keeping patient safety at the forefront of our interactions.
Importance of Norms
[House Rules]

Bedrock of High-Performing Teams and Healthy Organizations
Assume goodwill and conduct dialogue in a respectful manner. Listen, be non-judgmental and keep an open mind. Actively participate in meetings and discussions. Adhere to deliverables and deadlines established for the project. Strive for balanced discussion of all team members. Provide opportunities for input from dissenting and/or minority voices. Encourage respectful dissent as a way to arrive at fully-formed ideas. Offer solutions when presenting a problem or disagreeing.
Step 4: Develop ‘Civility’ Plan with Hiring Priorities, Policies, and Protocols

Policies for civility and incivility
Build a Civil Workforce

Hire for Civility
Vetting for Civility

In what areas do you have the least amount of patience working with coworkers? How do you deal with your impatience? Give examples.

If we asked your coworkers to describe your strengths/areas for improvement regarding collaboration and communication, what would they say? Give examples.

What are your most significant contributions to promoting teamwork and collegiality among coworkers? Give examples.

Describe a situation [ethical dilemma or conflict] you’ve experienced, how did you handle it…what were the outcomes/results?

Adapted from Cipriano, 2011
Step 5—Implement Action Plan, Policies, and Strategies

Implement an Action Plan with measurable goals—based on the Organizational Assessment

- Leadership development and skill building
- Communication, conflict negotiation, teambuilding
- Role-playing; practicing challenging interactions
Build a Conflict-Capable Workforce
Principled Negotiation

• Separate the people from the problem
• Focus on interests instead of positions
• Generate a variety of options before deciding what to do
• Insist that the result be based on objective standards/criteria

Getting to YES (Fisher, Ury, & Patton, 1991)
Insist on Using Objective Criteria

Using standards of fairness, efficiency, or scientific merit to resolve the problem increases the likelihood that the outcome will be fair and reasonable—and allows all parties to save face.

Examples:
- Empirical measures
- Policies and protocols
- Benchmarks
- Outcomes
- Evidence-based practices
- Professional standards
- Legal standards
Direct and Effective Communication

We must communicate openly and intentionally work together to create a culture of civility.
Assume Goodwill and Best Intentions
Avoid Judgments and False Assumptions
Make Patient Care the Focus

Implement the 200% Rule—
Everyone is 100% accountable for following safety practices and 100% accountable for making sure others follow safe practices

Requires: *Skill-building: Speaking Up; Communicating Effectively*

(Maxfield et al, 2011; Lyndon et al, 2015)
Cognitive Rehearsal: Evidence-Based Strategy to address uncivil behavior: Consists of 3 parts:

1. Learning and didactic instruction
2. Rehearsing specific phrases to use during uncivil encounters (creating and preserving a personalized statement)
3. Practice sessions to reinforce instruction and rehearsal

Griffin 2004; Griffin & Clark, 2014
TeamSTEPPS
Team Strategies and Tools to Enhance Performance and Patient Safety

An evidence-based teamwork system to improve communication and teamwork skills among health care professionals.

http://teamstepps.ahrq.gov/
CUS(sing): To get attention when you really need it: CUS!

I am Concerned

I am Uncomfortable

This is a Safety issue
Assume you are a nurse being treated uncivilly; using the CUS model, write a response to diffuse an uncivil encounter.
Example from Dr. Clark’s Class

I’m Concerned about our recent interactions and Uncomfortable with our lack of teamwork. Since this can affect patient Safety, let’s make a plan to work things out.

(Or for the Sake of …)
EXEMPLAR: Case-Based Scenario

“Nearly every day we are faced with the hand-off allergy list. Frequently the surgeons will order an antibiotic the patient is allergic to according to the safety checklist. When the patient is out of surgery, nurses have to call the surgeon, the anesthesiologist, and sometimes even the pharmacist trying to get someone to listen. It’s so frustrating, that sometimes we go ahead and give the drugs anyway knowing it’s not the right thing to do.”

The Silent Treatment; Maxfield D, Grenny J, Lavendro R. & Groah L. (2011)
Using the CUS Model

I’m Concerned about (patient name) and Uncomfortable administering this medication until we check her record for allergies to be sure it is Safe to give.
Step 6—Evaluation and Reassessment

Re-administer assessment measures to determine progress
Review, summarize, and present the assessment results
Gather new ideas for recommendations and strategies
Update and implement the revised Civility Action Plan
Step 7—Reward Civility and Reinforce Success

Social Activities and Celebrations
‘Brag Sessions’
Rewarding Collegial Accomplishments
Civility Achievement Awards
Professional Development
Recognizing and Rewarding Civility
Step 8—Expand the Civility Initiative

Share knowledge, lessons, and experience with faculty, staff, promising leaders and other interested parties

Identify leaders/members from the current Civility Team and recruit other interested team members to initiate the next phase of organizational civility
Self-Care and Stress Management
Work/Life Balance
The Stress of Incivility Changes Us
What are you doing to nurture yourself?
"I've learned that people will forget what you said, people will forget what you did, but people will never forget how you made them feel."

Maya Angelou
Questions, Comments, Ideas
Thank You ❤️

CIVILITY

Cynthia Clark PhD, RN, ANEF, FAAN
Nurse Consultant: ATI Nursing Education
Professor Emeritus
cindy.clark@atittesting.com