Nurse turnover in acute clinical settings

Shoshy Goldberg

H. Kerzman, M. Siman-Tov, L. Brin, S. Fridman, E. Lavon
Nursing Management Division, Chaim Sheba Medical Center

The study was supported by a grant from Israel’s National Institute for Health Policy and Health Services Research
Sheba Medical Center:

Affiliated with the Sackler School of Medicine, Tel Aviv University
Sheba Medical Center:

1,500 beds

120 wards

7,200 employees

2,500 nurses
Introduction

- Nurse shortages caused by high turnover is one of the most complex problems facing today’s health systems.

- Nurse shortages affect health care and economic outcomes (Dimick et al. 2001; Aiken et al. 2002; Tourangeau et al. 2002; Cho et al. 2003; Kane et al. 2007)

- Mapping the causes of resignation is necessary for improving nurse recruitment and staff retention in hospitals.
Methodological Variation

- Most frequent method: Surveys of working nurses regarding intentions to resign by means
- Less frequent method: Interviews close to the date of resignation
- Low response rate: Data collection by means of mail surveys

(Bowles & Candela, 2005; Morrell, 2005; Flinkman et al. 2010; Flint & Webster 2011; Hayes et al. 2012; Li Y & Jones C.B, 2013)
Methodological Variation

- No distinctions are made between nurses who resign and those who are dismissed
- The wide variety of measurement tools used prevents valid comparison between research findings
- Qualitative methods elicit deeper understanding of the causes of nurse resignation.

(Bowles & Candela, 2005; Morrell, 2005; Flinkman et al. 2010; Flint & Webster 2011; Hayes et al. 2012; Li Y & Jones C.B, 2013)
Objectives

1. To compare demographic and professional characteristics between nurses who resigned with those who did not
2. To describe the causes of nurses’ resignation
3. To compare attitudes of nurses who resigned with those of nurses who did not in two major hospitals
4. To compare department characteristics and nursing quality of care between departments experiencing turnover and those experiencing stability
Research Model

Department Level
- N of registered nurses
- N of academic nurses
- N of nurses with post-basic education
- Rate of resignation

Clinical quality of care:
- Falls and medication error reports
- Performance of clinical assessments at admission: pain, Norton, falls

Individual Level
- Professional autonomy
- Job satisfaction
- Perception of quality care
- Demographic and professional characteristics
Methodology

3-Step Design
Step 1: Matching Case-Control Methodology

- Matching case-control - 100 resigning nurses (case) and - 200 remaining nurses (control)

- Matching by department, age and gender

- Data collection – Telephone interviews close to date of resignation from two governmental hospitals
Step 1: Matching Case-Control Methodology

Response rate to telephone interviews: resigning nurses

- Resigning nurses: 67%
- Remaining nurses: 76%
Step 2: Retrospective Study
Individual Level

- Demographic and professional characteristics of one hospital’s total nursing staff (n=1,897) compared with nurses resigning (n=153) during 2012.

Exclusion criteria

- New nurses who began working as of 1.1.2011
- Retired nurses
- Nurses resigning for medical reasons
Step 3: Retrospective Study
Department Level

- All departments, including ER and ICU, from two hospitals (N=93)
- Departments were assigned to groups according to their resignation rates;
- Qualification criterion: At least one resignation during the research period
## Comparison between Total Population of Nurses and Resigning Nurses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Total Resignations (N=153)</th>
<th>Total Population (N=1,897)</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Female</strong></td>
<td>77.8%</td>
<td>86.0%</td>
<td>.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-30</td>
<td>30.4%</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31-40</td>
<td>46.9%</td>
<td>32.3%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41+</td>
<td>23.7%</td>
<td>46.2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The resigning nurses were characterized by young age and a high percentage of male nurses.
Demographic Characteristics of Resigning Nurses – Case/Control

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Study (N=100)</th>
<th>Control (N=200)</th>
<th>P-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Married</td>
<td>66.0</td>
<td>69.0</td>
<td>.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children</td>
<td>58.0</td>
<td>68.8</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed Spouses</td>
<td>87.9</td>
<td>78.5</td>
<td>.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA degree</td>
<td>30.0</td>
<td>19.0</td>
<td>.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seniority in organization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Up to one year</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Up to two years</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time employment</td>
<td>50.0</td>
<td>53.5</td>
<td>.031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-basic education</td>
<td>64.0</td>
<td>43.0</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managerial position</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>26.6</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Characteristics of resigning nurses: Low seniority in organization, no managerial position, MA degrees and post-basic education.
Results: Reasons for Resigning (n=182)

- Working condition: 33%
- Distance from place of employment: 30%
- Personal reasons: 16%
- Lack of professional advancement: 12%
- Work relationship: 9%

Working conditions: night shifts, physical difficulties’ too much responsibility
Reasons for Resigning by Demographic Characteristics

Working conditions were the most frequent reason given by married men aged 30+ working part time with up to 5 years of seniority.
Description of the reasons for resigning according to professional characteristics

Lack of professional advancement was most frequently cited by nurses with an MA education, holding a part-time job in managerial position.
Comparison of Perceptions of Professional Attributes: Resigning vs. Remaining Nurses

Contrary to the reports in the literature, we found no difference in perceptions of quality of care, job satisfaction and burnout between nurses resigning and those who did not.
Perceptions of Professional Autonomy: Resigning versus Remaining Nurses

Resigning nurses reported lower levels of professional autonomy than did remaining nurses.
Professional Satisfaction: Resigning versus Remaining Nurses

- Satisfied with being a nurse: 75% Resigned nurses vs. 83% Remained nurses
- High aspirations for professional advancement: 85% Resigned nurses vs. 75% Remained nurses
- Intention to seek employment in non-nursing profession: 18% Resigned nurses vs. 15% Remained nurses

*p<.05*
Logistic Regression Results: Factors Predicting nurses’ resignation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>OR 95%CI</th>
<th>P-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic education</td>
<td>0- No + BA 1- MA</td>
<td>2.55 (1.35-4.79)</td>
<td>.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managerial position</td>
<td>0-Yes 1-No</td>
<td>2.63 (1.13-6.13)</td>
<td>.025</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seniority in organization</td>
<td>Continuity</td>
<td>0.89 (0.83-0.94)</td>
<td>&lt;.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job percent</td>
<td>Continuity</td>
<td>0.98 (0.97-0.99)</td>
<td>.020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-basic education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional autonomy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High aspirations for professional advancement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Nurses having an MA but holding no managerial position were found to be 2.6 times as likely to resign in comparison to other nurses. Less-experienced nurses and nurses working part time were much more likely to resign in comparison to more experienced nurses.
Most resigning nurses had worked in the internal medicine or surgical departments.
No differences were found between departments with few if any resignations (no or low turnover) and departments with many resignations (high turnover) in terms of average length of hospitalization, average monthly admissions/releases, patient age, or clinical quality-of-care measures.
The current research made use of the Matching Case-Control methodology, meant to identify the risk factors affecting resignation.

The factors differentiating nurses who resign and those who remain focus on demographic variables and professional skills, not attitudes.

Among those resigning, most dominant were young nurses with an academic education and aspirations for advancement and professional development.
Nurse Retention – Group Intervention

- Full time job
- Unmarried
- Professional seniority of up to 5 years
- Professional seniority of up to 5 years
- Part time jobs
- Male nurses with seniority of up to 5 years
- Male nurses with no managerial jobs
- Seniority of up to 5 years and MA education
Dirty, white cap—no budget for replacement

Red, tired eyes

Messy, hair split ends—no time for haircut

Acne vulgaris

Awkward smile

Dark eyehags—due to lack of sleep

Pens in red, blue and black

ID, bandage scissors, penlight or extra pen, microphone

Aching back as a result of lifting, bending

Heavy load of px charts for charting nurses' notes

Stethoscope, penlight or extra pen

Cellphone with uniti call and text

Aching knee, leg & feet due to prolonged standing and running

Pretty old shoes

"Unwanted hairs"—lack of time to shave

Meal stub and coins

Rubbing alcohol or handgel, notebook

Dirty, blood-stained and body fluid stained shoes

NB: Advan white shoes

Sorry, that's not hot coffee. That's fresh urine specimen.
Thank you

köszönöm  תודה! děkuji
mahalo 고맙습니다
thank you
merci 谢谢 danke
Ευχαριστώ شكرا
どうもありがとうございます gracios