A Comparative Study of HIV Positive African Migrants' Efforts to Gain Health Services in the U.K. and U.S.

James Whyte IV, ND, PhD
Associate Professor and Associate Dean for Research
The Florida State University College of Nursing
The Starting Point

- The plight of undocumented African migrants living with HIV is one characterized by challenge and hardship in virtually every aspect of life.

- During my many years of working with this population I have observed many instances in which undocumented African migrants living with HIV/AIDS have suffered due to unmet medical and social care related needs.

- The joint consideration of HIV and the plight of undocumented migrants, coupled with my own life experiences offering services to, and advocating for, such people has led me to question the interaction between society, the law, healthcare agencies and this highly vulnerable group of people.
Migratory trends to the US and UK

- During 2009, INS placed the undocumented migrant population between 4.6 and 5.4 Million.

- During 2005 half, or 2.7 million, of these undocumented migrants were from Mexico, with an additional 335,000 and 165,00 respectively from the Central American countries of El Salvador and Guatemala Respectively. The highest percentages of these migrants are concentrated in the states of California, Texas, New York, Florida and Illinois (Listed in rank order).

- This is the portion of immigration that has become so politically charged in the US, after the attacks on New York, Washington D. C. and Pennsylvania in 2001.
The UK

- The UK offers a unique challenge with regards to the ability to quantify levels of undocumented migration.
- One factor that is likely adding to the problem is the annual trends with regards to asylum approval rates.
- These rates have decreased annually beginning in 2001, when 20% of applicants were granted asylum, until, 2004, when only 13% were granted asylum.
- Regionally, the bulk of cases originate amongst migrants from Africa, Asia and the Middle East respectively. The primary nationalities detailed in recent immigration statistics reflect that Zimbabwe, Eritrea, Iran, Somalia, and Afghanistan led the rates of asylum applications.
- While it is possible to quantify rates of asylum seekers to the UK, it is a far more challenging proposition to quantify levels of undocumented migrants.
HIV Cases - UK

HIV affected individuals accessing HIV care by area of residence in 2009: Rate per 1,000 aged 15-59

- More than 2 per 1,000
- 1 to 2 per 1,000
- Less than 1 per 1,000

London
Research Design

- This presentation is comprised of the results of two separate research studies.

- They were performed sequentially, with the UK study being initiated first and the US study being completed 6 months later.

- Grounded Theory Method

- The study included 16 clinical sites in both the UK and US.
Setting and Participants

- Based in NGO’s that provide services to HIV positive persons, with programming that addressed the needs of undocumented African Migrants.

- The participants were case managers within the respective agencies.

- Case managers who worked directly with African clientele were selected.

- These professionals integrate experiences with thousands of clients. This offered the opportunity to gain data regarding a wide variety of their client’s experiences.
Non Governmental Organizations
Initial Access to Treatment - UK

- Highly dependent on pending asylum application. This renders one eligible for NHS care.

- Continuous access to GP Care

- The GU Medicine Clinics are setting for HIV care.

- Prior to 2012, failure on asylum rendered one ineligible for care in the GU Medicine Clinics.

- Currently, one may continue to receive services, at the very least, to ensure that there are no therapeutic interruptions.
Initial Access to Treatment - US

- Clear statutory limits on access to publicly funded care.
- Prohibitions against the provision of social care to undocumented migrants.
- Fragmentation in the system.
- Extreme cost associated with gaining care.
- Highly limited migrant health services.
Figure 1: Theoretical Model for Undocumented African Migrants Access to Health services in the UK

Survival → Continued presence in the UK

Health Related Endeavors

Seeking needed health services
a-Failing secure care due to sociocultural factors
b-Seeking access through the GP.
c-Seeking HIV specific care through the consultant.

Striving to gain the resources necessary for survival:

a-Gaining employment
b-Working to gain governmental assistance.
c-Working to secure adequate housing.

Struggling to maintain access to health and social services.

Obtainable
a-Access to the GP for basic services.
b-Access to the Accident Emergency Dept. for emergencies.

Difficult to obtain.
HIV specific consultant care.

c-Seeking hope and security after failing to gain legal status

Deteriorating health status or deportation.

Working to gain asylum through the initial application and appeals process.

a-Navigating the initial asylum process.
b-Navigating the asylum appeal.

Initial Legal Status

Loss of legal status
Figure 2: Theoretical Model for Undocumented African Migrants Access to Health Services in the US

Survival → Health Related Endeavors → Continued Presence in the US

Identifying appropriate healthcare resources:
- Realization of need based on HIV status
- Delayed access related to fear or stigma
- Seeking care related to major illness
- Seeking care due to previous knowledge of HIV status

Navigating the complexity and cost of the system:
- Seeking care within the fee for service system
- Meeting realization of systemic costs
- Attempting to gain governmental assistance
- Seeking care through non-governmental bodies

Making due with available resources and striving for legal status:
- Realization of limits of service availability
- Making due with access to NGO based programs
- Ceasing to engage in health-related activities

Avoiding detection by Immigration Officials

Deteriorating health status or deportation

Initial Legal Status via entry visa → Working to gain legal immigration status:
- Working to establish grounds for asylum
- Working to navigate the admin requirements for asylum
- Seeking to establish a legitimate lifestyle

Loss of legal status
Discussion

- Basic needs and survival are the primary motivators despite disease.
- Stigma is a significant factor governing people’s behaviors related to accessing care.
- Success in the immigration process is a common theme in both countries.
- In the UK, access, however fragmented, is now possible.
- In the US, access to care is highly improbable.
Maslow’s Hierarchy of Needs

- **Physiological needs:** food, water, warmth, rest
- **Safety needs:** security, safety
- **Belongingness and love needs:** intimate relationships, friends
- **Esteem needs:** prestige and feeling of accomplishment
- **Self-actualization:** achieving one’s full potential, including creative activities

Self-fulfillment needs
Psychological needs
Basic needs