Outsiders in Nursing: An Integrative Review

OUTSIDERS IN NURSING - VOICES OF BLACK AFRICAN BORN NURSES & STUDENTS IN THE US: AN INTEGRATIVE REVIEW

By
Iheduru-Anderson Kechi DNP, RN, CNE, CWCN.
Akanegbu, Christiana DNP, APRN, FNP-BC, NRCME.
Inungu, Joseph M.D., Dr.PH
Background & Problem

- There is continuing efforts to increase the diversity of nurses as a means to improve healthcare equity and decrease health disparity in the United States.

- In order for diversity to be meaningful, all nurses must feel included and be able to participate to their fullest potential.

- “Being included in the society in which one lives is vital to the material, psychosocial, and political empowerment that underpins social well-being and equitable health” (World Health Organization’s (WHO) Commission on Social Determinants of Health).

- “To be an outsider is to be excluded, to feel low level of belonging, to feel invisible. Being an outsider can make one feel alone, lonely, isolated...faceless, nameless, and voiceless.” “Being an outsider means to be in a permanent state of transition.”

- Literature on the experience of African nurses and students indicate that the experience feelings of alienation and isolation in education and practice.
Purpose

- Describe the experience of being outsiders in nursing and nursing education as described in literature by Black African born nurses and nursing students in the US.

- Give voice to the experiences of BABN&SNs and highlight the need for open dialogue in schools of nursing and healthcare settings to address racial bias.

- Discuss the implications of othering of BABN&SN in nursing profession in US.

- Offer recommendations from literature based on the statements from BABN&SNs.
An integrative review approach discussed by Whittemore and Knafl was utilized to review literature from in peer reviewed nursing journal published from 2008 to 2019.

- CINAHL, OVID, EBSCOhost, PubMed Central, and Google Scholar.

- Search terms used include a combination of:
  - foreign educated nurses or
  - internationally educated nurses or
  - immigrant nurses
# Inclusion and Exclusion criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion 1: Year of publication</th>
<th>Inclusion criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>From 2008 to 2019</td>
<td></td>
<td>Published before 2008</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion 2: Language</th>
<th>Inclusion criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literature in published in or translated in English language.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Published in any language other than English language.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion 3: Terms, concepts, keywords</th>
<th>Inclusion criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Black nurses, Black African nurses, Black students, Black African students, African born nurses, African born student nurses, immigrant nurses, internationally educated nurses, foreign educated nurses, International nursing students,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion 4: Context and field of practice</th>
<th>Inclusion criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nursing education, Practice or professional context. Study conducted in or addressed the United States context</td>
<td></td>
<td>Non nursing studies, conducted outside the US or not addressing US context</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion 5: Publication</th>
<th>Inclusion criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peer reviewed and published in a nursing journal. Published empirical studies in valid peer-reviewed nursing journals CINAHL PubMed, EBSCOhost, PsycINFO, OVID, and Google Scholar.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Non-peer reviewed reports.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion 6: Methodology</th>
<th>Inclusion criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Original research study (quantitative, qualitative or mixed method studies)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Non-original research reports, Integrative or literature review research reports, opinion pieces.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion 7: Population</th>
<th>Inclusion criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subjects or participants must be exclusively or include Black African nurses or nursing students. Be nurse or students focused.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Reports did not separate findings about Black African Born Nurses and student nurses. Studies not focused on nurses (including patients, families, broad health service professions, and otherwise unidentified care workers), integration and</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

Table 1: Inclusion and exclusion criteria in search strategy and review
To judge the nurses’ experiences of the academic and work environment we looked at their description of feelings of belonging, isolation, being included, or excluded.

We also looked at their description of the attitudes of their colleagues, managers, and instructors, and their perception of availability and adequacy of support systems ranging from professional development, collaboration and provision of reasonable accommodation.

Overall, we looked at how this may have influenced their learning, work performance, sense of identity, and physical and psychological wellbeing.
Figure 1: Search Strategy

Literature search (2009 – 2019)
Online database search yield: N = 4009

Duplicates articles excluded. N = 2,852

Titles and abstracts searched for Inclusion/exclusion
Yield: N = 1157 Abstracts

N = 99
Read for inclusion/exclusion
N = 32 eliminated

N = 67 Articles
3 articles added
56 articles eliminated not meeting inclusion criteria

Final sample: N = 14 articles
N = 12 Qualitative
N = 0 Quantitative
N = 2 Mixed method

Figure 1. Search strategy.
Findings/Results

• Major findings include
  o Collegial/peer isolation and loneliness,
  o Racism and discrimination,
  o Unwelcoming environment,
  o Stereotyping and silencing of voices,
  o Personal resilience, and
  o Sense of belonging and being included.
Implications for Practice

- The effects of prejudicial and discriminatory practices impact the success of Black nursing students.

- Perpetrators include nursing faculty and staff, colleagues/peers, patients, and organizational leaders.

- Negative interactions with faculty, especially in front of other students or staff, could be humiliating and devastating for any student and especially for BABN&SN who are already experiencing undue stress navigating sometimes unfamiliar cultural environments.
Recommendations

- Nursing education programs should adopt less Eurocentric curriculum.

- Creating more inclusive workplaces and teaching environments where differences are respected and appreciated.

- Aligning teaching strategies to the students’ style of learning.

- Increase recruitment of diverse nursing faculty.

- Reducing linguistic and cultural biases in faculty-made exams.
Recommendations

- Knowledge about and appreciation for the education experiences of students of color are essential to create inclusive teaching and learning environments.

- Organizational leaders need to address diversity and cultural marginalization, which were challenges to foreign educated nurses.

- Facilitate professional development opportunities for all nurses and faculty on issues about race and racism.

- Require compulsory participation in quarterly or semi annual implicit bias workshops.

- Create mentoring programs for new international students.
Limitations

- The review only included studies published in peer reviewed nursing journals from 2008 to 2019.
- Majority of the articles cited are qualitative articles.
- Literature examining Black African born nurses and students.
- No clear strategic insights for BABN&SN.
- Needs for a greater understanding of the impact of full inclusion on BABN&SN learning and success in nursing.
Conclusions

- BABN&SN are integral part of the US nursing workforce and the healthcare system.

- Academic and work environments that support all nurses and students.

- Understanding the relational pattern that guides the BABN&SN socialization into nursing is vital to developing targeted support especially when entering the clinical practice environment.
Thank you!

Any questions?
Selected References

Selected References